

densely populated communities, a product of the persistent belief that the current of the St. Lawrence River was capable of purifying itself.

A comprehensive understanding of the extent to which poor sanitary practices threatened health and commerce in Montreal only emerged in the decades after Confederation. Gagnon links this development to the expansion of the city's professional middle class, which included in its ranks sanitary experts and bacteriologists. The emergence of such experts and their body of knowledge is another example of how international discourses were being put into practice at a local level, where they were adapted to fit Montreal's unique circumstances. Gagnon argues that the high costs of improving the city's infrastructure were brought about by the need to conceptualize the city as a comprehensive network, one whose growth would have to be carefully planned by a phalanx of trained professionals. Among other things, the transformation of drainage from a private undertaking to a public concern led to a remarkable expansion of the City of Montreal. The costly projects that local governments were urged to finance by the 1880s sounded the death knell for a number of small municipalities on the urban periphery, thereby leading to a flurry of municipal mergers in the closing decades of the nineteenth century.

Gagnon has crafted a useful contribution to the historiography of nineteenth-century Montreal, and will no doubt be of interest to those concerned with the emergence of the professional middle class, both in Quebec and elsewhere. *Questions d'égouts* demonstrates how Montrealers engaged with transnational discourses regarding living conditions in the industrial city. Readers, however, will be struck by the relative absence of the voices of those who suffered most from the abysmal condition of Montreal's sanitary infrastructure: its poor families and other marginalized residents. Gagnon's portrayal of the concerted resistance in the name of fiscal austerity faced by those who laboured to tackle the root causes of the city's notoriously unhealthy urban environment will prove to be particularly resonant to the twenty first century reader.

Dan Horner
York University

Celia Haig-Brown and David Nock, eds., *With Good Intentions: Euro-Canadian Aboriginal Relations in Colonial Canada* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1997).

As historians and scholars continue to delve into the complexities of Canada's colonial existence, new and perhaps yet-to-be categorized pieces of this imperial puzzle reveal themselves. Editors Celia Haig-Brown and David Nock deal with one such piece, that of Canadians of European ancestry who displayed sensitivities towards Aborigines while being fully implicated in the colonization process

(2). The contributors focus on individuals and organizations ‘with good intentions’ that worked with Aboriginal people against the injustices they faced in Canada between the mid-nineteenth century and the first two decades the twentieth. However, this collection is neither an apologist text nor one that aims to “vindicate the wrongs done to First Nations people and cultures as colonization proceeded” (1).

This twelve-chapter book begins with a well-crafted introduction by both Nock and Haig-Brown. In addition to discussing the impetus behind the writing of this work and the urgent need to address land claims, the introduction also includes concise explanations of the racist thoughts that were dominant from the mid-Victorian era to the early decades of the twentieth century. As the editors note here, this is particularly helpful to many ‘modern’ readers who have been reared on scholarship that discusses the negative legacy of residential schools and are therefore unfamiliar with the ideologies of biological racism and social Darwinism (5). Those that are categorized by Nock and Haig-Brown as having ‘good intentions’ include missionaries, ethnographers, secular advocates such as lawyers and government agents, and individuals with Aboriginal ancestry themselves.

Many of the notable works in this collection focus on Euro-Canadian individuals who challenged contemporary racialism and ethnography without an outright rejection of them. The chapters that are most illustrative of this approach include both of Nock’s pieces on Horatio Hale and Rev. E.F. Wilson. This is not surprising, as Nock wrote the bulk of the material on racism in the introduction. In these, Nock examines how Hale and Wilson promoted positive representations of the Aboriginal groups they visited in both Canada and the U.S, where their positive descriptions were attributed largely to a peoples’ adoption of agriculture, non-nomadic lifestyles, and Christianity (173). Thomas Abler’s examination of Rev. Silas T. Rand reveals a similar pattern. Convinced of the equality and common humanity of the Mi’kmaq to the white settlers in his Maritime home (74), Rand nonetheless had his beliefs bolstered by the agricultural and Christian pursuits of the Mohawk and Ojibwa that he had begun visiting in the late 1850s.

Perhaps the most radical of these Euro-Canadian challengers is Arthur Eugene O’Meara. Mary Haig-Brown’s analysis of O’Meara’s role as a missionary-turned-advocate for the Cowichan, Nisga’a and Allied Tribes of British Columbia in their quest for the recognition of Aboriginal title is both compelling and indicative of careful research. But in spite of her thorough discussion of his thoughts and actions as an advocate during the first two decades of the twentieth century, one cannot help but feel that Haig-Brown has not accounted sufficiently for the ethnocentric biases that would have influenced O’Meara, particularly in his early years as an Anglican missionary.

Other contributors examine the ‘good intentions’ of individuals of Aboriginal and Euro-Canadian ancestry and these are perhaps the most com-

elling selections in this book. For example, Sarah Carter examines how Amelia Paget, a woman with distant Aboriginal heritage, sought to provide authentic representations of Plains people in her 1909 *The People of the Plains*. Although Paget conducted her field work while inculcating the Eurocentric belief that it was necessary to capture Plains life before it inevitably vanished (201), her striving for veracity in these representations was her way of subtly “talking back” to demeaning colonial narratives, thus earning her the moniker of the “cordial advocate” (222). The actions of Nahnehahwequa (Catherine Sutton) are a good contrast to this “muted” approach. As Celia Haig-Brown proves, her ability to combine her Christian faith and Quaker support with her Anishinaabe oratory tradition gave Nahnehahwequa a vocal and visible, if ultimately unsuccessful, opportunity to try and reclaim her stolen family farmland in the 1850s and 1860s. Although it is never quite clear if Honore Joseph Jaxon’s Métis identity is adopted or biological, Donald Smith’s examination of him is an important inclusion here. From advocating aggressively for Métis rights to following the Bah’ai faith, through Jaxon, Smith demonstrates that the identities of the colonizer and colonized were never absolute.

These are just some of the essays that captured my attention while reading this collection. Overall, the book itself was well balanced in the sense that the contributions represented many facets of this theme found in the colonial dichotomy. The good intentions and shortcomings of Euro-Canadian missionaries are covered in the works by Nock, Abler, and Jan Hare and Jean Barman (who also offer interesting observations on gender and the colonizer). Additionally, Nock examines the good intentions in late Victorian ethnography, as does Wendy Wickwire in her later consideration of James Teit. The roles of Euro-Canadian secular advocates (or at least those whose primary motivations were not religious) are discussed in four of the essays, and they are particularly noteworthy because they do not ignore the existence of simultaneous Native agency. For example, Janet Chute and Alan Knight’s analysis of Allan Macdonell highlights the role of the Ojibwa during the Mica Bay incident in 1849.

With Good Intentions is a worthy contribution to Canadian colonial historiography as it offers multiple examinations of the motivations of those that occupied spaces that were so often in between that of the colonizer and colonized. As Nock and Haig-Brown write, Canada needs to move forward and decolonize; this kind of approach is important to understanding that Canada’s colonial history did include critics and not just those who defended its policies (5). Perhaps if there is one criticism that can be aimed at the work as a whole, it is at its overall structure. Although it is organized in an approximately chronological fashion, it does not always flow well. While this approach works when there is direct continuity between the works, as is the case with both Chute and Knight articles, there is a disjointed feeling between other works. Maybe this would have been eliminated had the collection been organized differently—perhaps by thematic groupings

such as gender, or geographic factors like region. Ultimately, *With Good Intentions* succeeds in its original goal of not being an apologist text, as the contributors are quick to point to the Eurocentric biases of the individuals and organizations that offered challenges and alternatives to colonial policies.

Melinda Nosal-Buzak
Wilfrid Laurier University

Samuel K. Cohn Jr., *Lust for Liberty: The Politics of Social Revolt in Medieval Europe, 1200-1425* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2006).

In *Lust for Liberty* Samuel Cohn sets out to examine revolts in medieval Europe between 1200 and 1425. The dates are chosen to allow a broad consideration of the situation before and after the Black Death, and the field is a little narrower than the title suggests, as he focuses on Italy, Flanders and France. Nonetheless, this is an ambitious study, based primarily on chronicle evidence from the areas under consideration, with judicial records from some Italian and French archives. In all, Cohn is using 1,600 descriptions of popular revolt dealing with 1,112 separate incidents (14).

Given the size of this database, Cohn begins by elaborating the problems of defining revolt. He argues, for example, that a revolt does not need to be violent, nor does it need to involve only peasants, workers or artisans; indeed one of the interesting themes of the work is the rebellion of the relatively powerful against their overlords (4-8). He spends chapters two and three taking apart our assumptions about medieval revolt. Thus he argues that most medieval revolts were not economic, nor were they bread riots of the starving, nor were they driven by women (whom he later argues were almost entirely absent from medieval revolts), nor did they necessarily fail.

Having spent the first few chapters disabusing us of our ideas about medieval revolt, Cohn then moves on to construct new typologies. He lays out an almost bewildering variety of revolts, including revolts of the people, revolts against the Crown, against territorial dominance, against merchants and oligarchies, and by women and youth, among others. This is the richest and densest chapter, and by itself does the most to emphasize the variety of medieval revolt and the dangers of setting up simplistic notions of 'norms' of 'peasant revolt'. It also suggests the ubiquity of revolt, not simply by the number and range of revolts that it elaborates, but by demonstrating that judicial records reveal revolts that go unmentioned in local chronicles, thus indicating that the real number of revolts is probably higher again. The drawback to this chapter, and a problem that runs through the book, is that many of these revolts get mentioned, sometimes numerous times, without the revolt in question ever being fully described or contextualized.