

Riojas' study, which tackles questions concerning how organizations and bureaucracies respond to pressure from insurgent movements, will be of less interest to historians on this score. Furthermore, one wishes that Riojas' study would have displayed a historiographical engagement with some of the important monographs and essays comprising the new Black Power scholarship. Nonetheless, Riojas has provided a thoughtful and substantive contribution to the emerging new literature on the origins of Black Studies.

Peniel E. Joseph  
Brandeis University

**Richard Hudelson and Carl Ross, *By the Ore Docks: A Working People's History of Duluth* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2006).**

**Joe William Trotter Jr., *Black Milwaukee: The Making of an Industrial Proletariat 1915-1945*, Second Edition, (Urbana, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2007).**

In the fall of 1994, *International Labor and Working Class History* printed a series of essays and comments under the title "ILWCH Roundtable: What Next for Labor and Working Class History?" The scholars contributing to the roundtable disagreed as to whether there was in fact a crisis in the discipline or whether labour history was, in the words of one essay title, "out of vogue". Despite the cautious optimism evinced by a majority of the contributors, anxieties over the demise of the new labour history—especially in its Anglo-American form—have only increased since the mid 1990's thanks to the ascendance of the cultural turn and the West's move towards a post industrial economy. Such developments have diluted the explanatory force of class analysis which is fundamental to the new labour history's objective of forging a 'usable' past. In light of these occurrences the recent publication of Richard Hudelson and Carl Ross' *By the Ore Docks: A Working People's History of Duluth* and the second edition of Joe W. Trotter's new labour classic, *Black Milwaukee: The Making of an Industrial Proletariat 1915-45* seems defiantly nostalgic.

Indeed, *By the Ore Docks* is chiefly concerned with revealing the indebtedness which the currently revitalized labour movement of Duluth owes to its past (274). The book is a collaborative work which draws on the talent of Richard Hudelson, a philosopher of Marxism at the University of Wisconsin and Carl Ross a local labour activist who served as director of the twentieth century Radicalism in Minnesota Project of the Minnesota Historical Society. Unfortunately, Ross passed away in the spring of 2005 and was unable to comment on late revisions of the book. Impetus for this project was derived from Hudelson's curiosity about the role of communists in Duluth—a community steeped in social democratic ten-

dencies thanks in large part to its Scandinavian heritage. Hudelson admits that while trying to assess the influence of communists in Duluth he found that such questions were inseparable from the ethnic and labour history of the city.

*By the Ore Docks* follows a straightforward narrative framework devoid of any theoretical diversions. The authors trace Duluth's development from the 1860's as a fledgling community situated next to the great iron ore deposits on the west bank of Lake Superior. As in most other Midwestern communities railroads were an essential aspect of capital and social development. Local railway companies imported large numbers of low wage foreign workers, chiefly from Scandinavia and eastern Europe to work on the tracks beginning in the early 1870's. By 1889, labour and ethnic tensions brought about by such growth and anxieties over the widening gap between Duluth's contract labourers and eastern based investors boiled over into the city's bloodiest strike in which over forty strikers and police were seriously wounded and two strikers lost their lives.

By the turn of the 20th century, U.S. Steel had consolidated its hold on Duluth's political economy and in the process developed a simple labour philosophy: "if a workmen sticks up his head, hit it" (44). Not surprisingly organized labour in Duluth generally maintained an accommodationist craft unionism allied with the America Federation via the Duluth Federated Trades Assembly. The fledgling radical opposition centered in the local Socialist Party while ostensibly committed to the class struggle, spoke in a pronounced ethnic vernacular owing to its near homogenous Finnish character. This ethnic monopoly on progressive politics was broken in 1913 when Duluth's unskilled, multiethnic ore dock workers went on strike, giving the Industrial Workers of the World (IWW) their long awaited opportunity to enter Duluth's political landscape. While unsuccessful in prosecuting the strike to a successful end the IWW was ultimately able to seize control of the local Socialist Party and lay the groundwork for future progressive alliances under the Farmer Labour Party (FLP) and Congress of Industrial Organizations (CIO). However, while the authors tacitly acknowledge the contentious process of 'whitening' that informed the forging of these pluralist alliances, at times the process takes on an inevitable quality that obscures the class and gendered dynamics which informed this process.

In post war Minnesota the populist FLP was part of a national effort by progressives within and outside the AFL to change the face of national politics. Although left radicals agitated for the establishment of an autonomous FLP, the majority of members were staunch anti-communists and conceived of their organization as a way station prior to eventual integration with either the Democrats or Republicans. Regardless, progressive goals for industrial unionism were eventually curtailed by McCarthyism and the deindustrialization of Duluth. The loss of a radical perspective on the social justice consequences of industrial unionism left many of the city's workers without the political tools to address the far reaching changes wrought by the post industrial order. Yet with 30-35 percent of its work-

force currently unionized Duluth is still very much a union town and in 1997 activists launched a successful living wage campaign which consciously drew on the social justice traditions of the city's labour past.

Hudelson and Ross's decision to bring their meticulous narrative into the present day while serving to historicize their work also illustrates the weakness of the community study in their privileging of narrative. The internal logic of the community study demands that its empirical character reaches a resolution, that its minutia coheres, a need which often obscures the larger significance of the analysis and renders its findings limited and incidental. Perhaps this inability to transcend the limits of community can be traced to issues of historiography and methodology. Although briefly citing the seminal works of Herbert Gutman, David Montgomery and Gary Gerstle the footnotes evince a distressing lack of any systematic engagement with the relevant literature (labour or otherwise) on issues of race, class and gender. This is an error that prevents Hudelson and Ross from placing their conclusions in a larger historical context. This is perhaps understandable in light of the fact that neither Hudelson or Ross are practicing historians, but the total aversion to theoretical frameworks on the part of the former, a philosopher of Marxism, is especially puzzling.

In contrast, Joe Trotter's *Black Milwaukee* avoids the trap of insularity by applying a multifaceted theory of proletarianization to its evolution of the formation of Milwaukee's black working class community. While Trotter's research is decidedly thorough it was his positing of the early-mid twentieth century urban black experience as a process of industrialization, which set the first edition of *Black Milwaukee* (1985) apart from the prevailing norms of ghetto scholarship. Trotter's greatest accomplishment is melding the historical with the sociological (and a touch of Marxist theory) to craft an analysis which privileged blacks as active industrial agents, rather than mere sociological abstractions caught in an endless cycle of pathology and victimization.

At first glance Milwaukee seems like an odd choice for a case study of the proletarianization of a northern black populace. In fact it is precisely because of the city's seeming 'exceptionalisms'; a small black population, disproportionate black dependence on factory work and a progressive political tradition that Trotter justifies its selection as a corrective to the heretofore prevailing generalizations about black urban life gleaned from major centers such as New York and Chicago. A focus on Milwaukee is particularly helpful in complicating standard Marxist interpretations of proletarianization as a deskilling process. For Trotter, proletarianization constituted an almost exclusive shift upwards in the occupational fortunes of Milwaukee's black working class.

*Black Milwaukee* is divided into three parts. Part One, consisting of a single chapter examines the socioeconomic and political experiences of blacks in pre World War I Milwaukee who were nearly completely relegated to the domestic and personal service sphere. The onset of the Great Migration and the accompanying

process of proletarianization form the focus of Part Two and its three chapters. The third and final section of the book comprised of three chapters detailing the tenuous position of black industrial workers between 1933-1945. However, in many ways it is the richly detailed appendixes which constitute the most vital part of the book. Appendix seven: *Afro-American Urban History: A Critique of the Literature* has become a classic due to its concise, nuanced, and erudite analysis of the scholarship surrounding the black urban experience. This second edition, while including a new preface, acknowledgements and prologue also includes new essays by Trotter, William Jones, Earl Lewis, Alison Isenberg and Kimberly Phillips discussing the impact of *Black Milwaukee* on the study of African American urban/labour history. Isenberg's nuanced essay, *Transcending Ghetto Boundaries*, is especially useful for elaborating the links between racial consciousness and theories of spatial isolation.

One of the most intriguing aspects of Trotter's work is his positing of racial identity as a pragmatic historical development. Despite the temporary gains afforded blacks by membership in the CIO, the persistence of racial discrimination on the part of Milwaukee's industrialists and AFL locals worked to eventually fracture interracial unionism. Corporate appeals to whiteness provided white workers the opportunity to assess the tangible benefits to be had from an investment in white privilege. Though compelling, Trotter's interpretation of whiteness as a top down phenomena, a form of false consciousness instilled into the working class by conniving capitalists has since been disproved by the work of David Roediger and his arguments for the 'wages of whiteness' emanating from the working classes.

Although sensitive to the lived experience of racial identity and its political consequences, Trotter deftly illustrates how the 'imagining' of these communities was not inevitable. Although blackness was not an entirely reactionary identity, the logic of race in the context of early 20th century American capitalism dictated that it was inextricably tied to shifts in whiteness. Key examples of this are outlined in chapters four and five in which Trotter cites the respective limitations whiteness placed on local socialist and subsequent CIO programs of social democracy. Though separated by class, Milwaukee's industrial back workers continually found themselves thrust back into the arms of the fledging black bourgeoisie. And while the black middle class was often hostile to the notions of industrial democracy racial politics dictated that any appeals to social and economic equality were voiced in the rhetoric of race. While class formed the basis of community organization race served as the vehicle through which this organization was conducted.

Thanks to its original methodology, outstanding research and meticulous attention to detail *Black Milwaukee* has become a seminal work in labour history. As Earl Lewis argues in the appendix, it is nearly impossible to deal with issues of the urban black experience without engaging the work of Trotter in *Black*

*Milwaukee*. The weaknesses of the book; its relative inattention to gender, excessive statistical analysis and failure to fully comprehend the interior life of its subjects (shortcomings which Trotter acknowledges in the revised epilogue) while significant do not entirely detract from its general accomplishment of restoring the agency and humanity denied to urban blacks in the literature of the ghetto synthesis.

Although it seems all but assured that the linguistic turn will continue to push the practitioners of the new labour history to the margins of the discipline, *By the Ore Docks* and *Black Milwaukee* remind us that this development might not be without its drawbacks. While discursive analysis is a necessary method for deciphering historical experience, the work of Hudelson/Ross and Trotter remind us to stay attuned to the power of material forces in historical development. Even though the social community study evinced in these works has assuredly run its course, a theoretically reconfigured model of the community study, which discerns the global in the local, can help inform our understanding of broader shifts in capital development and the ways in which we can engage these changes.

Paul Lawrie  
University of Toronto

**Peter Brock, *Against the Draft: Essays on Conscientious Objection from the Radical Reformation to the Second World War* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006).**

As any researcher of pacifism will be aware, with the exception of M.K. Gandhi, most war-resisters, non-violent protesters and other ‘peaceniks’ are frequently written out of history on the grounds that there are so few of them. Consequently it is often argued that war-resisters have made little impact on attitudes to war. Professor Peter Brock has made a life study of pacifists and war-resisters, and his work has both depth and authority. In this collection of essays, Brock has “limited the time-range . . . to a period of 420 years” (3) and has included Britain, Europe, North America, Australia, New Zealand, and Japan, in a roughly chronological order, although more than half of the twenty-five chapters concern events in the first half of the twentieth century.

Accustomed to grim accounts of the treatment of British conscientious objectors in France during World War I, I was surprised to find instances of quite enlightened treatment encountered by objectors across the centuries. Brock points out that pacifism was not an original tenet of Quaker faith, some Quakers having fought in the English Civil War. They adopted the Peace Testimony in the 1650s and henceforth disowned members who took up arms (4, 53). During the Napoleonic Wars, Quakers were among the victims of the practice of press-gang-ing men into the Royal Navy. The fascinating contemporary account of Thomas