Grape Vines and Orchard Lines: ni-Vanuatu in Central Otago

Naomi Calnitsky, Carleton University

Introduction

In the small orchard and vineyard towns of Central Otago, in Alexandra, Cromwell and Roxburgh, one could see the men frequenting the supermarkets, or stopping for an iced cream after a long day’s work out-of-doors. Alexandra’s “Seasonal Solutions” pilot scheme transplanted some forty-five men from their home islands in Vanuatu to New Zealand’s South Island to labour in the vineyards and fruit orchards. This was meant to help redress the seasonal labour shortages growers had experienced, for a three-month “trial period” in 2007. A second working group was trans-located to New Zealand for a longer period of seasonal work, spanning the antipodean summer harvest months of 2007-08. One spirited worker decided to form a string band to help distract the others from thinking of Vanuatu. The band gained attention from local communities through their lively performances, with groups performing in Alexandra and Roxburgh at Christmas and at Dunedin’s Saturday morning farmer’s market in early March 2008. The migrant men brought their home island culture to a place, climate, and landscape that would soon become familiar to those returning for a second or even third working term in New Zealand. For many in the group, working in New Zealand was their first exposure to a foreign nation. They overcame language barriers, encountered new and challenging living expenses, and were separated from their family members for extended periods of time.

New Zealand’s Recognized Seasonal Employer Scheme (RSE), developed from its pilot form into a nationwide plan that, as of 2010, “provide[d] for up to 8,000 workers annually to be engaged planting, maintaining, harvest[ing] and packing crops in the horticulture and viticulture industries for up to seven months in a year.”2 In Canada, the Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program (SAWP) similarly draws in farm labourers from the Caribbean and Mexico for a period of up to eight months at a time, but has a much longer history, one that most Canadians may approximate. As early as the mid-nineteenth century in British Columbia, Hawaiian male labourers (or kanakas, as they were often called) performed harvest work on cranberry farms at Fort Langley in the Fraser Valley.3 As Tom Koppell notes, Fort Langley was by 1856 already engaged in the business of exporting cranberries en masse to San Francisco markets, some “469 twenty-four gallon barrels.”4 In the same region today, Mexican migrant berry pickers now perform similar tasks. Similarly, in early twentieth century California, farm labour was relegated primarily to immigrant groups from Asia, including budding Chinese, Japanese, Filipino and South Asian communities. Yet, agriculture did not always constitute the exclusive domain of the foreigner; in British Columbia, early twentieth century patterns of
rural prejudice helped define inter-ethnic hostilities as well as Anglo-Canadian nativism. In the Okanagan region, these patterns served to carve out a place for white female labour in the apple-packing industry in response to the perceived threat of the Chinese labourer.

My objective in Central Otago was to discover the extent to which this circular agricultural work scheme benefited migrants from Vanuatu, and how much it benefited New Zealand growers. I sought to uncover views from the “other side,” and determine what underbelly world of labour existed in New Zealand as a result of its connections with its Pacific neighbours. I wanted to locate sites of migrant agency amidst the often-asymmetrical international circumstances and uneven relations of economic and technological power that appeared to exist in this part of the world. This article specifically considers why and how New Zealand came, in the twenty-first century, to actively import labour from the Pacific to suit its productive labour needs. While I do not address the reasons why New Zealand failed to source Melanesian labour up until this time, it should be noted that in the late 1960s and early 1970s, New Zealand did import labourers from a number of Polynesian states to fill more difficult physical jobs. This was accomplished in a manner that similarly proved circular and did not involve processes of immigration.

In April of 2007 I travelled to Cromwell in search of the group of ni-Vanuatu workers. On 27 April 2007, the pilot group, who were employed primarily in apple work and on vineyards, put together an evening of song and dramatizations
at Cromwell’s Presbyterian Auditorium. This involved prepared theatrical scenes depicting Vanuatu’s unique history of contact with European explorers, traders, missionaries, and black-birders. The evening was advertised in a local paper, the Cromwell Bulletin, and also by a hand-made sign at Cromwell’s New World Supermarket: “The Amazing Vanuatu Vineyard & Orchard Workers String Band & Vocal Concert…Not to be missed…Your opportunity to contribute and enjoy with fellow Pacific citizens” (See Fig. 1). Mimicry and humour were interwoven into the performances, to convey historical situations to a local audience in continuance with a Vanuatuan oral tradition that has worked to inscribe collective historical memory into popular consciousness, and a theatrical tradition made popular by Vanuatu’s Wan Smolbag Theatre. Missionary land appropriations in the islands were re-enacted (“you axe, me land!”), as was the plight of early missionaries (“I need a drink!”) and one of the “worst” kinds of early encounters, “nakedness!”

Theatre could empower, personalize history, and enable historical reclamation in a post-colonial context. The Vanuatu islands, formerly the New Hebrides, were throughout the 1970s engaged in political shifts that ultimately led to their independence from Britain and France. In addition, one group of workers took to the stage to perform spiritually inflected gospel pieces, with an introduction:

you will hear a lot of songs tonight about Christ…it is because of where we come from…the white man (brought) the gospel to Vanuatu…this time, we’d love to bring the gospel back to New Zealand.

One gospel song performed by the group, affirming “God is love, we’re His little children,” illustrated the extent to which inhabitants of the archipelago were Christianized (See Fig. 2).

Fig. 2
Ni-Vanuatu Seasonal Workers Performing Gospel Music in Cromwell
(Photo: Naomi Alista Calnitsky, Cromwell, 2007)
I conducted thirteen short oral history interviews with a sample of workers to help better construct a history of this seasonal migration from below. Since 2007, numerous research reports have contributed to a budding literature on the developmental impact and consequences of New Zealand’s RSE scheme. These include studies from Australia that have compared the RSE scheme with a later Australian one that engaged a number of Pacific island states on a smaller scale. However, fewer studies have researched the phenomenon using an oral history approach.

Workers from the Pacific Islands were, in this instance, courted by New Zealand agriculturalists to help meet horticultural and viticultural demands that could not be filled by New Zealand citizens and other itinerant workers. The intent of my own study was to privilege these workers’ voices, stories, and opinions, and it emerged out of postgraduate research investigating New Zealand’s postwar links with the Pacific. I paid particular attention to New Zealand’s dependence upon nearby islands for labour and the emergence of Pacific Island dependencies on emigration. This study recorded migrants’ perspectives on labour in New Zealand, allowing living subjects’ stories to contribute to the process of history formation in contemporary New Zealand.

Oral history especially suits labour history, operating as a vehicle that can better situate the everyday worker at the steering wheel. It also has direct utility for addressing a central aim of postcolonial studies, that of providing a space for the subaltern subject to “speak.” The importance of combatting archived perceptions about what constitutes the nation, and rewriting worker narratives into the center, demands a renewed interest in the power of oral history in an age of neoliberal re-orientation of seasonal labour according to the profit motive. The challenge of writing labour histories in the twenty-first century is all the more challenging given the more dramatic dislocations enacted by the powerful pulls of global commerce and exchange.

In Central Otago, productivity fluctuated, and wine and fruit production in the region was predominantly a late twentieth century phenomenon. Vineyards first emerged in Central Otago in the 1860s and by the 1880s Jean Desire Feraud was winning awards for his yields. In 1895, viticulturalist Romeo Bragato declared the Central Otago region suitable for grape growing, but a strong Temperance Movement and lack of interest from the Department of Agriculture hindered grape plantings from that time through the Second World War. During this time, the district was also viewed as too cold for grape growing.8 New Zealand’s Public Works and Irrigation Department, established in 1936, first brought water to the fruit-land region, and wine growers in Central Otago commonly used burning pots of oil to fight frost. Dr. Greta Cone suggested trying grapes from cooler climates, and early 1970s grape trials introduced varieties from Germany, some of which fared well in the region.

An explosion of vineyards in Central Otago followed the trials, while sum-
mer fruits also emerged as the “new gold” of the region. With the onset of the RSE scheme for horticulture, Pacific Islanders increasingly replaced local harvest labour, which tended to include youth and itinerant workers from Europe. When I had a chance to engage in harvest work with apples, cherries and nectarines in the Roxburgh region in 2008, I worked alongside labourers from the Czech Republic, Sweden, and France, as well as a ni-Vanuatu group.

From an historical vantage point, labouring overseas was nothing new for natives of Vanuatu. A history of circular mobility and indenture since the onset of black-birding in the 1860s took them into closer contact with natives of neighboring islands, transported convicts, and European colonists, traders, and planters. However, it should be noted that the majority of the participants in my study had never before experienced any form of work abroad. While Pacific lands were claimed by colonists for their productive potential and as niches for settlement, the South Pacific labour traffic claimed the lifeblood of Melanesian islands for work on developing plantations. France sought out a stake in the New Hebrides, the colonial name for the Vanuatu archipelago between 1906 and 1980, so that it might secure control over its crucial labour supply for transport to New Caledonia. Meanwhile, French colonial Tonkin supplied much of the indentured French plantation labour on the New Hebrides islands in the 1920s and 1930s. Tonkinese in the New Hebrides found their way into domestic work as well, while British colonists preferred native Melanesian servants. Labour transportation for New Hebrideans during the early period of the traffic caused cultural hybridities and material changes, integrating Melanesia more deeply with neighbouring colonies (especially Fiji, Australia and New Caledonia). The traffic, which brought Melanesian islanders into contact with Fijians, indigenous kanaks, convicts, and French settlers of New Caledonia, and the Aborigine and European inhabitants of Queensland, would serve to bolster the regional mobility of New Hebrideans.

While New Zealand had no direct colonial ties to the New Hebrides, the reach of European colonization in the archipelago was profound. Margaret Rodman’s work on the fashioning of colonial architecture and space under the Anglo-French Condominium describes how Tonkinese performed critical roles as domestic servants in French colonial households in the islands, allowing for what she terms an expansion of “bourgeois sensibilities” in shifting colonial spaces. In Houses Far from Home, Rodman points out how “simply tearing down the house of colonialism is another kind of imperialism, a conquest that makes it harder to find among the rubble the meanings that were colonialism’s posts, beams, shingles, and trim, much less its occupants.” British colonials in the New Hebrides colony were reluctant to employ Tonkinese transplants and demonstrated a preference for Melanesians as domestics.

The New Hebrides were governed for much of the twentieth century under the dual oppression of an Anglo-French Condominium, established in 1906 as a compromise to placate British commercial and missionary interests in the is-
lands when French settlers sought to annex their entirety. They did not attain political self-rule until 1980—much later than most post-colonial independence movements. Under a 1914 Joint Protocol, Europeans’ rights to residence, personal protection, and trade had been guaranteed through the establishment of judicial authority in the form of local French and British courts. These courts functioned as tools to ensure colonials’ interests were prioritized, especially in the face of vernacular native resistance and resurgence movements.

Christianity, first introduced to natives of the archipelago by missionaries stationed in the islands, would also affect overseas labourers, especially those transported to Queensland, Australia. Catholic, Seventh Day Adventist, and Presbyterian missionaries all had a penetrating presence in the New Hebrides. Bibles were translated into native vernaculars, schools were built, and native lands were claimed for missions that taught islanders to sing and pray. New Zealand's links with the New Hebrides were cemented by the Melanesian Mission, which sent teachers to the islands and baptized thousands of native souls. Missionary activities were not met without resistance. In the 1930s and 1940s, the John Frum cult encouraged the “coming of a time when white men will leave Tanna.” Incited by antagonism towards Presbyterian missions, John Frumism also promoted anti-European thought, while a European rationalism, Christianity, and court system made little room for the proliferation of native ways or Kastom to justify the suppression of traditional mysticism in the islands.

In the 1960s, grassroots Nagriamel and Tamata movements voiced collective opposition toward European encroachment, Tamata aiming to reclaim alienated lands. In Albert Leomala’s 1970s poem, “Cross,” the cross was urged to “run away” as it was “destroying” his traditions. Settler interests ultimately came into conflict with late colonial indigenous land claims, and redistributive processes began in 1969-70, with indigenous citizens gaining constitutional rights to perpetual land ownership in 1979. The UN mediated Vanuatu’s decolonization process. With the arrival of independence, the Vanua’aku Pati had the support of most rural inhabitants, and the joint imperial project ultimately lost out to popular Melanesian demands for self-rule.

The colonial period also transformed the archipelago’s economy, expanding its “productive” capacities and linking the islands more closely with regional and global export markets. By 1980, more than four-fifths of ni-Vanuatu took part in rural activities, and self-sufficiency continued for the most part except in urban zones. Post-colonial Vanuatu’s economy plummeted after land redistributions took effect and productivity decreased on landholdings previously owned by Europeans. Earnings from tourism rose in the 1990s, with private investment concentrated predominantly in hotel accommodation. While France dominated the archipelago’s exports during the colonial period, Vanuatu’s export market has since become more diverse.

Oral histories revealed that most of those ni-Vanuatu employed in Central
Otago were town dwellers at home and had had some form of previous employment. They came from villages like Ranon, Ranvetlam, Faramzu, Motalava, and Mele. Many expressed interest in returning to former jobs upon their return home, while others indicated that they planned to take some time off until their next contract in New Zealand. In Canada, Mexican farmworkers involved in the SAWP also often worked jobs in Mexico during off-seasons, including in construction, the petroleum industry, or taxi driving, but most often in agricultural work, including in oranges, coffee, ranching work, or sugarcane. For ni-Vanuatu, orchard work was admittedly more difficult than vineyard labour, and its pay was also inferior, since it depended largely upon the amount and extent of work carried out by the individual rather than the hours worked. Hourly pay, in contrast, was garnered with vineyard work in Central Otago, regardless of how hard one worked. Mexican migrant SAWP workers in the Okanagan region, including in sites at West Kelowna, Okanagan Falls, and Oliver, British Columbia, were similarly found to be employed on vineyards, but only more recently in the Canadian past. The BCSAWP was not initiated until 2004, and prior to this, SAWP workers from Mexico did not form a part of the British Columbian labour force.

In many cases, earnings in New Zealand for ni-Vanuatu RSE workers would be spent on school fees for island dependents. “School fees” was a common answer among ni-Vanuatu participants in my oral history study when asked to disclose how their New Zealand earnings might be spent in the home islands. Many of the men from the pilot group had left behind wives and children to work overseas. Workers had wives employed in women’s centres, as teachers, as commercial bank tellers, in gardening, or preoccupied mainly with childcare. The highly gendered New Zealand work scheme left wives in charge of young children, leaving the men to fraternize amongst themselves. In Canada, the SAWP continues to prove highly gendered, however it also includes a fair number of women, many of whom have also left children behind to engage in agricultural work contracts. The majority of invited workers are men, despite the increased role played by women in industries such as floriculture, fruit harvesting, and fruit packing jobs in Canada. Field labour positions in Canada were still often reserved for men. For ni-Vanuatu pilot scheme workers, families were temporarily divided, and reunification periods proved temporary for those planning to return for another seven-month seasonal working period that encompassed 2007-8.

Migrants in New Zealand’s colder South Island climate had to undergo some adjustment from the temperatures they were used to at home. On Sundays they visited local churches, because Sunday was normally their only day off from the ten-hour orchard and eight-hour vineyard workdays. In their free time, the group watched television, interacted with other foreign orchard and vineyard workers, frequented town shops, rode bicycles, or went for walks or short car rides. The group was hand picked from a larger number of applicants in Vanuatu. Four hundred and fifty applications were received for a far smaller number positions offered by New
Zealand recruiters in 2007. Linguistic diversity was evident amongst the group, some of whom had a very limited command of English or French, and island vernaculars were often spoken in the workplace.

The Seasonal Lives of Ni-Vanuatu in Central Otago

This section looks at a series of oral histories that sought to restore authority to participant workers. Working contracts in New Zealand were often framed in terms of new economic challenges as well as opportunities. As this group entered into new relationships with New Zealand employers, a new trajectory of power relations was put into effect, shaped by embedded class dynamics but also by differences in culture.

Solomon, a 30 year old from Ranon, Ambrym, made carvings to sell on his free time. In describing Vanuatu, he noted it has two active volcanoes and two mountains, and fifteen uninhabited islands out of a total of eighty islands. Travel in Vanuatu was much cheaper: for $1 you could bus a long distance. Food was costly in New Zealand and much cheaper in Port Vila. So was clothing: in New Zealand he bought only second hand clothing. At home, Solomon had a boat that could transport six people. He worked in fishing, selling fish in Port Vila, and wanted to start his own fishing company with his New Zealand earnings. Before returning to Cromwell in November for another seven months of work, Solomon planned to return to his fishing work in Vila for one month and then return to Ambrym. Upon his third working term in New Zealand, he planned to work as a supervisor in the vineyards.

Patrick, who was 34, from Ambrym and Port Vila, originally worked as a radio station D.J. in Vila. He explained: “the 15 of us…we are a bit different…we have been sponsored by the World Bank…they [came] and picked me up in Port Vila because I have been traveling abroad…I left the job, my family and I came.”20 Patrick left a wife and three children, aged eleven, five and, one, and was eager to return home. Apple picking was heavy, and hard work, whereas vineyard work was easy, eight hours long as compared to ten in the orchard. At the end of the day, it was the same with vineyard and orchard work, except one earned less in the orchard if one was a bit tired, whereas in the vineyard one was paid an hourly rate. In his free time he played soccer with “other friends [working the vineyards], like Brazilians and Mexicans.”21 At the time he was not sending money home whereas “other boys did”; for him it was “still okay” since his wife worked as a teacher.22 Still, he did not spend most of his earnings, which were funneled back to the home communities. This response proved common in my oral history study: the idea of funneling economic aid back toward communities rather than solely toward a nuclear family unit. In Vanuatu, the sustainability of communities continues to depend largely upon interactions taking place beyond the mere family unit.

Aaron, aged 30, from the village of Mele, Efate came to New Zealand to apple pick at Southern Orchards, Roxburgh. In Vanuatu, he had two boys, four
months old and five years old. His wife, a commercial teller at a bank, had not wanted him to leave for work in New Zealand. He came “wanting [to] make something out of what he was doing” and earn enough to build a home. In Vanuatu, Aaron worked as a mechanic and in the recreational scuba diving industry, which has gained popularity among tourists from Australia and abroad. He believed that if his English improved he would be able to understand more, because language was one of his main challenges as a worker in New Zealand. He liked the work, and on Sundays attended the Baptist church. In his free time he liked meeting friends and “driving around…see most of the town…[I] just go with …New Zealand friends…I am not driving.” Aaron believed that the stay in New Zealand was “too short…at least it is good, I enjoy the job.” He sent $500 home once in the mail and was saving the rest. In New Zealand, he spent his earnings on venison beef, lettuce and greens at the supermarket. Upon returning home he planned to finish working on his mother’s van and visit his “nice beach…with a nice warm sun” with his family. Depending on how hard he worked, if he earned $3000, he would be able to use the money to buy more land at home. He would agree to return to New Zealand if things were going well, and admitted that he would be grateful to return.

Henry, 28, worked as a hospital nurse in Vanuatu, where he was living “in town” (Port Vila). As a seasonal worker in New Zealand he had left behind a girlfriend and two children aged three and eight. He came to New Zealand for the experience and to see the “difference” between the money that could be earned in New Zealand and Vanuatu. In New Zealand, money was better, yet things were more expensive. Henry also commented that the government tax in New Zealand was very high. He chose not to send money home by mail. In his free time in New Zealand, he would “go out with friends, hunting and shooting goats…in the hills.” He wanted to use the money earned in New Zealand to start a small store and possibly return to hospital work later on. Henry was excited to return home “just to run away from the winter.”

James, 30, from Motalava, Northern Vanuatu, left two children, aged seven and six, a wife who worked at a women’s center, and a job as a hotel barman to work in the vineyards. At the hotel he was “not making much money, like $80 for a week,” and planned to come to New Zealand “to earn some money to go back and [start] my own resort in the island in the northern part of the country.” New Zealand was here depicted as a transitional working space in which savings could be acquired to remake life conditions at home according to personal ideals or aspirations. In his free time he played soccer and watched videos. By April, James had sent $400 home on two occasions. Once home, James wanted to locate another job and rebuild his hut-house with what he had earned in Cromwell.

Daniel, 20, from Ranon, Ambrym Island, was a student of math, English, and science in Port Vila before working in New Zealand. He came because Seasonal Solutions wanted to help the community and encouraged him to come. Challenges
in New Zealand included cold weather and food: “I don’t know how to cook… only rice… I know how to cook rice, that’s all.” He wanted to return to school in Port Vila to become a teacher, and use the money earned to pay his “seven or eight” siblings’ school fees. With $500 earned per week, he first wanted to “fix the school fees” and then “make a proper toilet” and build a nice kitchen at home. Small, developmental improvements like these were similarly evidenced in other studies of the RSE scheme’s impact on ni-Vanuatu communities. Daniel’s parents were planters of crops: they cultivated yams as well as bananas. Daniel liked work in New Zealand, yet missed Vanuatu and wanted to live there permanently, and he also wanted to return to Central Otago in November for another 7 months. In his free time he watched television, walked around and visited shops, and thought New Zealand was a nice place with friendly people.

Another worker, Theo, aged 26, was from Komera, Tanna Island, and had left behind two children, one “just a baby,” a four year old, and a wife who took care of them. As in other accounts, children were left behind, and the New Zealand contract was understood as a realistic way to raise school fee funds. In Vanuatu, Theo used to work security at a Port Vila Westpac Bank. He came to New Zealand wanting to experience more in life and to ensure a good standard for his kids. In his free time Theo liked to go out with friends and “look at the places.” Accommodation costs at his New Zealand workplace were always deducted from his pay. By April he had sent $200 home. Theo found Port Vila very different from New Zealand, where his workday lasted from 7 A.M. to 4.30 P.M. The New Zealand work ethic in this case differed markedly from working experiences in Vanuatu. As Tony Ballantyne’s work has shown, in nineteenth century New Zealand, there was a gradual effort to incorporate the Maori labour into the fabric of rural productivity, which was established through codes of time-discipline imported from England’s Industrial Revolution. Upon returning to Vanuatu, Theo wanted to help his community and possibly work at his previous job for a few months.

Others, like Nicholas, found New Zealand’s climate “very cold.” Nicholas was equally surprised at the number of trucks. In his time off he enjoyed visiting places in New Zealand, and wanted to start a pig and chicken farm upon returning home. Richard, 45, from Ranvetlam, left his four children and wife to work in New Zealand; his wife did not work and his kids went to school. Richard used to work as an export officer for Air Vanuatu and joined the workers’ union. They went on strike for salary improvements and he was then “kicked out,” and left unemployed for two years. New Zealand’s weather was a challenge and he had little free time as he worked almost ten hours a day. As a result, after the workday, he was tired and went to bed. Free time was relegated to Sundays, when he sometimes attended church. Richard preferred living in Vanuatu, yet needed money to pay his family’s school fees, while a part of his earnings went to the community. Richard commented, “things here are expensive…food and other things…back home, back on the islands we grow our own food, we don’t buy things from the shop…” (we) fish
in the sea, hunt in the bush...life on the islands is free.”356 This subsistence mode of living meant that he and fellow islanders were still only partially integrated into a monetary economy in 2007. Still, Richard was not very eager to return home, wanting a visa extension, and enjoying the seasonal work available in New Zealand.

In my 2012-2015 oral history research study with Mexican farmworkers in Canada, I discovered in many cases a similar degree of complementarity, between workers’ personal aspirations and the benefits of seasonal jobs on Canadian farms. While my Canadian study represented an extension of the techniques and aims used to interview seasonal workers in New Zealand, the Canadian SAWP scheme continues to suffer from a diminished reputation, especially for its pattern of tying guest workers to particular employers without allowing them to circulate freely upon the Canadian agricultural labour market. While return workers from Mexico were often “named back,” developing relationships of familiarity and affinity with particular farms, at 2007, the Vanuatu program was still new, and would require a number of years of return migration for workers to develop familiarity with specific employers on host farms, vineyards, and orchards. In some Canadian cases, such as orchard work in the Okanagan Valley, Mexican SAWP workers were found to work alongside Canadian itinerant workers, and this also proved true in New Zealand, where ni-Vanuatu were found to be working alongside itinerant workers in the rural region surrounding Roxburgh in Central Otago.

Arnold, 33, from Ranon, Ambrym, had a wife who performed gardening and childcare. At home, he grew crops and would sometimes do “the fishing...I sell the fish, but most of the time I just take the fish to the families.”357 This trend, of communitarian self-sufficiency, was unique to life on his home island, and markedly different from patterns of individualism prevalent in the West. In Vanuatu, it was more difficult to earn money, while work in New Zealand was very good, orchard work being the hardest part. Arnold also played music in his free time: “when we came here there was nothing to do” and the boys felt “sick, homesick, so I tried to form a band” to distract them from thinking of Vanuatu.358 This was Arnold’s first trip to another country and he was “glad” and “happy” to see a new culture and place, commenting that the people were so friendly. In New Zealand he could earn “a bit more money than in Vanuatu, because [in Vanuatu] there was nothing we could earn money out of.”359 He planned to return home “for a rest” and then come again to New Zealand to work. With saved earnings, he planned to pay school fees for the children, since, due to problems with the school fees many had dropped out of school.

My final three interviews confirmed subsistence trends linked to garden labour in Vanuatu, and a lack of a thriving economy. Edward, 31, from Ranvetlam, Ambrym, came to New Zealand for “grape pickings, apple picking, fruit picking.”40 In Vanuatu he built houses and liked his work. He stated that in Vanuatu, “our money is not really good.”41 Work in New Zealand was “good” and easy but Edward had had no former experience in fruit picking.42 In Central Otago, he worked “Mon-
day to Saturday,” and in his free time liked to walk around. Upon his return he wanted to pay his brothers’ school fees, and would likely continue building houses. Eager to return home, Edward still liked seeing new things, finding New Zealand quite different from home. For workers like Edward, the seasonal contract in New Zealand was akin to travelling to a new and unfamiliar landscape, providing a desirable change of scene from life at home.

Abram, 40, from Faramzu village, Ambrym, did not marry in Vanuatu. He worked in the garden, growing yam, taro and cabbage, as did his parents. He came to New Zealand to help his family and really enjoyed the work; picking apples was the hardest part of his job. In his free time he enjoyed visiting the surrounding area. His main expenses were food and clothing, and at one point Abram ventured to Dunedin, a city located some three hours from Central Otago, to visit a hospital for a spider bite. Environmental perils have similarly been documented in studies of farm labour in North America. For example, in Frank Bardacke’s account of Southern California farm work, one oral history participant described the prevalence of “rattlesnakes” while grape picking.

A final interview with Leo, 27, from Ambrym, described that he was not married but had a brother and two sisters. At home, he worked the garden, growing yams, Fijian taro, cabbage, banana, manioc and kumara. He came to New Zealand so that he could “take the money back” to pay school fees: “the money I am saving for our community…our home.” Leo also commented that, in his free time, when it was raining, he could not go walking. He thought New Zealand was “cool” except “winter was very cold.” He was excited to return to Vanuatu, planning to rest, and wanted to return to work in November. While Leo’s experience with garden work at home did not necessarily translate to experience with industrial harvest work, Leo’s lack of “formal” employment in Vanuatu made him a good candidate for seasonal migration to New Zealand.

In all, the thirteen participants in my study offered varying responses that reflected a range of personalities and opinions about place, home, work, and landscape. These responses would have invariably evolved had I conducted a follow-up study with returning workers after they had experienced more than one season of work and gained increased familiarity with New Zealand as the RSE program continued to impact their lives. Therese Macdermott and Brian Opeskin note how the New Zealand Department of Labour’s description of the RSE scheme as having largely “achieved its goals” in fact still continued to conflict with other concerns that remained unresolved, including those relating to “pay and deductions, cost and quality of accommodation, hours of work and productivity, and induction and training.” Other studies have focused on the question of poverty as it related to New Zealand’s recent selection of seasonal agricultural migrants from Tonga through the terms of the RSE. While the interviews I collected in 2007-08 reflected the novelty of a New Zealand landscape, patterns of inexperience, and new engagements with monetary accumulation in the context of Vanuatu’s markedly different
structures of subsistence and exchange, in fewer cases did respondents overtly complain about inadequate conditions of accommodation, the problem of pay deductions, or the length of the working week. Such critiques have continued to come largely from external observers, specifically as they have intersected with modern sensibilities and standards at play in a contemporary context of labour rights and equity in New Zealand. While similar critiques have emerged in Canada in response to SAWP workers’ rights, evidence of dissent directly from Mexican “offshore” workers was also evident in numerous instances.  

**Reconceiving Locality and Integration: New Zealand and the Pacific**

In the post-1945 period, New Zealand’s place as an advanced, industrialized host country in demand of labour from nearby Pacific economies allowed these island nations to become new satellites responding to the pull of work opportunities in New Zealand. The compelling pull of capital and employment saw the influx of increasing numbers of migrants from Polynesian nations to New Zealand in post-war decades, yet New Zealand experienced far fewer cases of in-migrations from Melanesia. The pilot scheme deployed for Central Otago was described as “cutting edge” but not a program that involved “immigration.” Seasonal Solutions, the Central Otago agency that hires temporary workers for picking, pruning, thinning, packing, sorting, fork-lifting, and tractor driving, initially paid for the travel expenses of thirty pilot scheme workers while the remaining fifteen were sponsored by the World Bank.

A good part of Central Otago’s cherry harvest went to waste in January 2008 because some orchardists found themselves with an inadequate number of workers and their harvests could not be carried out in full. Ni-Vanuatu migrants could be found harvesting cherries by the five kilogram bucketful at an orchard in Roxburgh, one of the few large-scale fruit operations that employed the group (see Fig. 3). Kerimuir Orchards’ export quality cherries were sent to Taiwan and Malaysia, while bruised or split cherries were discarded for their lack of market value.

![Basket of Marketable Cherries, Roxburgh, New Zealand](Photo: Naomi Alisa Calnitsky, 2008)
Australia has proved more reluctant to hire temporary Melanesian labour for seasonal work, despite the argument that labour market access might be used as a form of reparations to the archipelago for past injustices carried out in Queensland.\textsuperscript{51} Australian fruit producing regions like the Murray Valley employ a Polynesian workforce of Samoans and Tongans. In 2008, however, workers from four Pacific countries—Kiribati, Papua New Guinea, Vanuatu and Tonga—were incorporated into a pilot Pacific Seasonal Labour scheme for horticulture in “nominated regional locations.” This turned the tide against previous policies of limited Pacific Island labour integration into Australian horticulture. As Macdermott and Opeskin observe, “proponents of seasonal worker schemes have acknowledged that they often involved compromises in which individual rights of workers are traded away for greater access to employment opportunities in developed countries.”\textsuperscript{52} While around fifty Tongan pilot workers were engaged in almond picking and grape pruning in Victoria and citrus harvesting in Queensland, only six migrants from Vanuatu were offered “permanent employment” in the Griffith region.\textsuperscript{53}

Melanesia’s historical experience of mobility and material transformation, as it intersected with temporary employment on nearby productive zones and encountered by natives of the former New Hebrides and associated labour supply islands, was replicated to a certain extent in Central Otago, yet in a more modern fashion. Circular migrations to New Zealand reveal continuity with historical patterns of Melanesian mobility, labour recruitment, and indenture. Transported overseas to labour in sugarcane, coffee, cotton, mining, and as domestic servants, Melanesians from the New Hebrides served French, British, and Australian employers predominantly in Queensland, Fiji, and New Caledonia. New material factors, like European clothing, wages, and muskets were provided to recruits. Melanesia is now perhaps more integrated than ever with its neighbouring metropolitan worlds, while remaining remote enough for the preservation of traditional lifestyles in many areas. At the same time, tourism has allowed Vanuatu to become increasingly integrated economically with neighbouring Australia.

Labour mobility heightened the integration of New Hebrideans and later ni-Vanuatu with neighboring host nations. In Australia, imported Melanesian labour in the later decades of the nineteenth century enabled sugarcane planters to prosper in Queensland and carried out other odd jobs such as the construction of the port at Townsville. In a similar way, imported Melanesian labour today aids New Zealand’s fruit and wine growers. The fabric of seasonal migration is now more deeply set in New Zealand, where Central Otago, Marlborough and Hawkes Bay wines, apples and stone fruits, are taken from productive plots to their marketable form with the aid of a Pacific Island harvest work force. While the nineteenth century Pacific labour traffic altered the internal composition of host nations with lasting effects, producing small Melanesian diaspora communities “overseas” within the region, current projects involved seasonal circular migration will not likely alter the composition of host societies in the long term.
Many natives of Vanuatu today still survive through a subsistence arrangement that does not rely on any regular wage-earning income source. In other cases, subsistence farming supplements income earned in town or by other means. Port Vila’s short-lived tax haven status, which began in 1971, generated a limited source of employment for ni-Vanuatu alongside domestic manufacturing, offering comparatively high wages within the region. While subsistence lifestyles remain common, a cash economy has pervaded Vanuatu’s schooling and healthcare systems, churches, and community obligations. Monetary networks have also permeated Vanuatu’s import/export markets, manufacturing centres, and tourist zones. Tourism in Vanuatu has gained relevance as a source of income for ni-Vanuatu employed in hotels and as tour operators.

Musical performances in Vanuatu’s hotel industry were replicated in Old Cromwell Town, where ni-Vanuatu migrants performed to help supplement seasonal wages. Given $50 per week from Seasonal Solutions for food, and with hostel accommodation costs deducted from wages, music was a way to alleviate homesickness while raising extra funds for home communities. In April 2007 at a concert in Cromwell, the workers demonstrated pride for their home islands, waving the Vanuatu flag, and offering up Oamaru stone carvings for auction to the crowd. The local Pakeha (non-Maori) community responded enthusiastically, with carvings receiving final bids of $65, $110 and $210 (see Fig. 4).

Though not really constituting a diaspora, this group epitomized a transnational subject, caught between spaces, cultures and landscapes and in service of a globalized economy and an established settler colony. The labour scheme allowed some to gather the purchasing power to procure cellular phones, portable CD play-
ers, and new necessities like sports bags, rechargeable batteries, and blankets in New Zealand. Other regions in New Zealand suffered labour shortages similar to those experienced in Central Otago, and have, in the past, similarly looked outwards to the Pacific to secure labour for forestry, tobacco, scrub-cutting, fruit picking, and industry. The explosion of vineyards in Marlborough necessitated an “army of foreign workers,” with migrant workers from Thailand reportedly working 60-70 hour, seven-day weeks, as well as public holidays in 2007. Marlborough growers recruited a small number of Tongans for vineyard work in 2008, imported labour from the Pacific ultimately providing a more stable workforce. While illegal and informal migration for the vineyard and orchard industries has occurred to a small extent, managed migration schemes have predominated to meet the year-round needs of horticulture in a way formally endorsed from above.

Schemes in the 1960s and 1970s similarly allowed guest workers from the Pacific to become temporarily incorporated into the national labour force, as migrants from Tonga and Fiji were recruited to perform forestry and agricultural jobs. Permits in 1969 enabled Fijians to engage in agricultural labour (scrub-cutting, fruit picking, and flax cutting) for four-month periods. However, after four months of scrub cutting in the Napier area, the Napier Telegraph reported Fijians leaving conditions of back-breaking work described as slavery, vowing “never to return,” with one Aisake Tavutau indicating regret for having worked in New Zealand. In 1972, some 150 Fijians were recruited for tobacco work in Nelson. These work schemes, it was argued, were designed to benefit New Zealand more so than Pacific nations; they had potentially dehumanizing effects, dividing families, despite some positive effects of migration.

In New Zealand, temporary work permits have had their shortcomings. For example, the “dawn raids” of the mid-1970s that carried off Polynesians charged with illegally overstaying work permits led to a unanimous condemnation of Gestapo-like tactics. These raids were meant to deal with alleged “overstayers” from the Pacific—mostly Tongan and Western Samoan migrants who had stayed beyond the length of their work visas. While Vanuatu has developed a structural dependence on overseas aid, it never formed any real structural dependence on emigration and remittances as did the Polynesian island nations of Tonga, the Cook Islands, or Western Samoa, who had all experienced economic emigration in the wake of New Zealand’s postwar manufacturing boom. Since 1980, Vanuatu’s foreign aid was derived increasingly from the international community, yet foreign aid often proved ineffective at solving the small country’ political difficulties. Internal crises of governance fed into international discourses over the provision of aid to Vanuatu; Australia has in the past threatened to reduce bilateral aid to Vanuatu over governance issues. With an overseas work scheme, internal aid could be infused directly communities “from below.” Still, the capacity of this aid remains limited, and is reduced by costs of living associated with work in a host nation. This detracts from any given work scheme’s potential to improve living conditions at home.
New Zealand’s experience with circular migration and seasonal work has had mirrors elsewhere in the world. In North America, a “half-open door” system has enabled South-to-North mobility for guest work since 1966.\textsuperscript{38} SAWP, for example, was established in 1974 to facilitate the seasonal entry of Mexican migrants for agricultural labour in tobacco, fruit, and vegetable growing and was preceded by an “Offshore Program” that allowed Caribbean workers to labour in the apple and tobacco industries of Southwestern Ontario.\textsuperscript{39} More than 10,000 Mexican migrant farm hands worked in Canada in 2002, generating, not insignificantly, over $80 million in remittances.\textsuperscript{60} In New Zealand, the fluctuating character of agriculture renders temporary schemes advantageous for growers. In Otago region, the numbers of seasonal workers needed in the peak summer months of January and February range between 4,500 and 5000 but hit a low of 200 in July-September, while in Hawkes Bay, labour needs peak in March at 17,700 and plunge to around 800 in September-October. The Bay of Plenty, similarly, requires 12,000 in April-May.\textsuperscript{61} According to these dynamics, work schemes oriented carefully around seasonal timing have continued to allow guest workers to access the labour markets of more developed nations in a way that has rendered permanent immigration and access to citizenship obsolete. At the same time, a sense of labour stability for horticulture is provided. One vineyard contractor related how in Central Otago “backpackers and itinerant workers worked well for a few days” but then developed “sore backs and arms” or were drawn away to the “glittering lights” of Queenstown, whereas Pacific Islanders could stay to work for the entire season.\textsuperscript{62}

In Canada, one might source a fine New Zealand wine grown and produced with the aid of migrant workers from Vanuatu, or one might choose a more local Okanagan wine that similarly benefited from the labour of Latin American guest workers. Guest workers lived temporarily “in-between” two nations. As such, they often have difficulty accumulating savings when tied to subsistence wages in host nations where food and accommodation costs differ greatly from the cost of living at home. In Otago, living costs served as major capital sinks for guest worker wages among ni-Vanuatu attempting to accumulate savings for home island improvements through labour migration. Some wanted to build proper toilets, fix their hut-houses, or build new homes and businesses in Vanuatu, and for many, New Zealand’s cost of living proved a challenge.

From a more economistic perspective, the RSE has been framed as a development initiative on the part of New Zealand. John Gibson and David Mackenzie recorded changes to RSE worker household incomes, measuring improvements in “subjective well-being” and other indicators such as “consumption, savings,” and “community-level impacts,” documenting “positive effects” for the sending countries of both Tonga and Vanuatu.\textsuperscript{63} In terms of scale, New Zealand’s RSE scheme has surpassed Australia’s recent Pacific Islander work scheme in agriculture, while Canada’s reliance on seasonal labour migrants remains far greater. Mackenzie and Gibson concluded that New Zealand for the most part achieved its developmental
goals, measured through increases in household assets and savings. When viewed as a “development intervention” with a positive outcome, New Zealand’s image as an employer of seasonal migrants in agriculture continues to differ from Canada’s still-tarnished image in its record on seasonal agricultural guest workers. While Pacific futures will continue to depend on accessibility to the labour markets of more developed nations, host nations will need to increasingly accommodate diverse peoples whose labour power has offered a new impetus for the traversing of boundaries but whose status has had to remain, by definition, impermanent.
NOTES

1 The author would like to thank the anonymous reviewers for the comments and suggestions on ways to improve this article. It should also be noted that this article is drawn from MA research carried out in the Otago region of New Zealand in 2007-2008. The case study of migrant labour in horticulture in this region comprised thirteen oral history interviews in total and forms a part of my MA Dissertation in History, “Colonized Pasts, Labour Circuits and Post-1945 Mobility to New Zealand” (University of Otago, 2008). For a full record of interviews, see Calnitsky, “Colonized Pasts,” Appendix Six, “Oral Histories,” available at the Hocken Library Collections and University of Otago Library, Dunedin, New Zealand.


4 Ibid.

5 The term ni-Vanuatu is used to denote natives of the Archipelago.

6 Concert Recording, (80 minutes total), Presbyterian Auditorium, Cromwell, April 27, 2007.

7 Ibid.

8 For more on this regional history see Romeo Bragato, “Report on the Prospects of Viticulture in New Zealand,” September 1895; Alexandra Museum Exhibitions; and John McCraw’s *A Fruitful Land: The story of Fruit Growing and Irrigation in the Alexandra-Clyde District* (Dunedin: Square One Press, 2005).


10 Ibid., 34.

11 “Miscellaneous Papers relating to the New Hebrides administration, etc. 1955-1973,” NHBS 5 VI items 1-13, New Hebrides British Service Series, University of Auckland Library Special Collections.

12 “Papers relating to the John Frum cult, 1941-2,” NHBS 17 Items II–III, New Hebrides British Service Series, University of Auckland Library Special Collections.


15 See Barry Weightman and Hilda Lini, eds. *Vanuatu*, (Christchurch: Institute of Pacific Studies, 1980) and “Miscellaneous,” NHBS.

16 T.K. Jaramayan, Financial Sector Development and Private Investment in Vanuatu, (Christchurch: Macmillan Brown Center for Pacific Studies, and USP Insti-

17. Calnitsky, “Harvest Histories,” (Forthcoming) Chapter Four. These findings are drawn from an oral history study that took place in Manitoba and British Columbia between 2012 and 2015.


21. Ibid.

22. Ibid.


24. Ibid.

25. Ibid.


27. Ibid.


30. Ibid.


32. Ibid.

33. For more on the relationship between missionaries, Maori and rural productivity in nineteenth century New Zealand, see Ballantyne, Entanglements of Empire.


36. Ibid.


38. Ibid.

39. Ibid.


41. Ibid.

42. Ibid.


44. Frank Bardacke, Trampling out the Vintage: César Chávez and the Two Souls of the United Farm Workers (London: Verso, 2011).


46. Ibid.

47. Ibid.


50 One case of a worker-authored grievance in British Columbia was set in writing with legal aid, and was co-authored by a group of Mexican seasonal farmworkers employed on a cranberry farm. See “Letter of Concern from the Mexican Agricultural Workers of the Golden Eagle Group Farm, Pitt Meadows, Carta de preocupación de los trabajadores agrícolas mexicanos de la granja Golden Eagle Group, Pitt Meadows.” The text of this grievance letter can be found at http://www.justicia4migrantworkers.org/bc/pdf/press_pack_may19_06.pdf (Accessed Sept. 31, 2016). After helping to craft this letter, once worker, Marcos Baac, received a notice that he would be “sent back to Mexico immediately.” During the first year of the “Offshore Program” in Canada, a group of Seventh Day Adventist workers sourced from the Caribbean expressed complaints over working on Saturdays, and were ultimately sent back because they could not meet farmers’ demands. See Vic Satzewich, *Racism and the Incorporation of Foreign Labour: Farm Labour Migration to Canada since 1945* (London, New York: Routledge, 1991). Overt resistance also occurred in Leamington in 2000 when a work stoppage was staged to contest a foreman’s abuse, leading to the deportation of sixteen workers. See David Bacon, *Communities without Borders: Images and Voices from the World of Migration* (Ithaca: ILR Press, 2006).

51 See Nic Maclellan and Peter Mares, “Remittances and Labour Mobility in the Pacific,” (Pacific Labour and Australian Horticulture Project, Institute for Social Research, Swinburne University of Technology). This research article also argued that Australian policies tended to privilege permanent migration over temporary, with permanent migration seen as more conducive to the process of nation building.

52 Macdermott and Opeskin, “Regulating Pacific Seasonal Labour in Australia,” 283.

53 Ibid., 298-299.

54 Jaramayan, Financial Sector Development, 17.


Ibid.

“Horticulture New Zealand” (pamphlet), courtesy of Seasonal Solutions, Alexandra office, New Zealand.


Ibid.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Archival Collections
New Hebrides British Service Series (NHBS), University of Auckland Library
Special Collections, Auckland, New Zealand.
Islanders—General.”

Primary Works
Alexandra Museum, New Zealand. “Vines to Wines” (Exhibition) and “Fruit
Growing in Central Otago” (National Film Unit).
Bragato, Romeo “Report on the Prospects of Viticulture in New Zealand,” Sep-
tember 1895.
Calnitsky, Naomi Alisa. April 2007 Oral History Interviews with “Henry,”
“Solomon,” “Patrick,” “Aaron,” “James,” “Daniel,” “Theo,” “Nicholas,”
“Richard,” “Arnold,” “Edward,” “Abram,” and “Leo.”
Justicia 4 Migrant Workers. “Letter of Concern from the Mexican Agricultural
Workers of the Golden Eagle Group Farm, Pitt Meadows.” April 7,
2006. Available at:http://www.justicia4migrantworkers.org/bc/pdf/
press_pack_may19_06.pdf (Accessed Sept. 31, 2016)
Seasonal Solutions, Alexandra. “Horticulture New Zealand” (Pamphlet).

Secondary Works Cited
Ballantyne, Tony. Entanglements of Empire: Missionaries, Maori and the Question of the
Bardacke, Frank. Trampling out the Vintage: Cesar Chavez and the Two Souls of the
Basok, Tanya. Tortillas and Tomatoes: Transmigrant Mexican Harvesters in Canada.
Bangstor, Daniel Aaron et al. Yumi Stanap. Christchurch: Pacific Churches Re-
search Centre, 1981.
Barry Weightman and Hilda Lini, eds. Vanuatu. Christchurch: Institute of Pacific
Studies, 1980.
Bacon, David. Communities without Borders: Images and Voices from the World of Migra-
Basok, Tanya. Tortillas and Tomatoes: Transmigrant Mexican Harvesters in Canada.
Brown, Diane. “Cool change for Vanuatuan workers,” Otago Daily Times, Janu-
Calnitsky, Naomi Alisa. “Harvest Histories: Mexican Agricultural Labourers in
Canada since 1974,” PhD Thesis, Carleton University, Forthcoming,
Winter 2017.


Maclellan, Nick and Peter Mares, “Remittances and Labour Mobility in the Pacific.” Pacific Labour and Australian Horticulture Project, Institute for Social Research, Swinburne University of Technology.


