## 140 left history

notes, also served as precursors to the modern welfare state. By outlining the social welfare services numerous police departments provided, from housing unemployed, transient men, to settling domestic disputes, this book gives another glimpse into the pre-welfare state reaction to poverty and the origins of this institution. Marguis' discussion of how the CACP responded to and handled organized crime, juvenile delinquency, and the "war on drugs", stretching back to their efforts to eliminate the use of opium, or the "dope evil" in the 1920s, will add to the work of social historians and sociologists in assessing the extent to which the Canadian state and its agencies attempted to regulate most aspects of civil society and maintain a strict sense of law and order.

Similar to most books devoted to the history of a single institution, the ability of Policing Canada's Century to explore the broader context of twentieth century Canada is constrained by its narrow focus. At times the book becomes rather encyclopedic in approach, with an absence of solid conclusions in regards to the impact of the CACP's actions on its milieu. For instance, Marquis contends that the growth of organized crime in the 1970s "was reflective not only of Canada's increasing diversity, but also of a general decline in police authority." (355) He fails to discuss, however, how the CACP, or local police forces, by targeting certain ethnic minorities, notably 'Orientals,' as prime suspects, played a part in fostering a public panic over organized crime and its alleged perpetrators.

This oversight is indicative of the prevailing weakness of the book's concluding chapters. The initial sections dealing with the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries are the strongest, reflecting Marquis' previous work on the police in Toronto and the Maritimes. Yet as the narrative moves beyond World War Two and into the 1970s and 1980s, the material and analysis become somewhat thin. Marguis should not be faulted for braving uncharted waters, but more could have been done on how the Charter of Rights shaped the policies of the CACP and the duties of police officers generally, vis-a-vis investigating crimes and apprehending offenders. Police relations with natives and other ethnic communities, at times hostile and confrontational in the last twenty years, could also have been more closely considered. Nevertheless, Policing Canada's Century stands as a significant contribution to our understanding, not only of this facet of the Canadian state, but of some of the intricacies of the law and the response by law enforcement officials in this country to crime. Police history, with Policing Canada's Century to its credit, is now poised to assume a more prominent position in Canadian historical scholarship.

## Michael Boudreau Queen's University

Ruth A. Frager, Sweatshop Strife: Class, Ethnicity and Gender in the Jewish Labour Movement of Toronto, 1900-1939 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press 1992).

For the past two decades, labour, immigration and women's history have been arguably the most intellectually vibrant fields of historical enquiry in Canada. Contributions from scholars in these fields have served to correct the narrow and elitist class-, ethnic-, and genderbiased tendencies that existed in Canadian historical writing well into the 1970s. Yet, as several scholars have observed, to date there has been only a limited integration of immigration, labour and women's history. As a result, questions of ethnic, gender and class identities in Canadian history have usually been treated separately. Rarely has the interplay among the three been examined. This oversight has given rise to some simplistic and ethnocentric interpretations of the behaviour of immigrant workers, interpretations that have usually regarded ethnicity and class, or class and gender, as competing claims, and mutually exclusive.

Increasingly, however, historians are paying closer attention to these intersections of consciousness, viewing the three as different strands of one fabric, interwoven and inextricably linked. This is the basic premise underlying Frager's study of Toronto's Jewish labour movement in the first half of the twentieth century. Frager confines her analysis to East European Jewish immigrants in Toronto's needle trades, an industry which came to be dominated by Jewish workers/employers in the decades immediately preceding the Second World War. Frager's choice of this particular ethnic group was a logical one: here was an instance in which a large proportion of workers in one industry displayed a highly developed and intense workingclass consciousness, especially in the interwar era, the period to which Frager devotes most of her attention. Here was an instance in which a strong commitment to class interests coexisted with, and was in fact bolstered by, a strong sense of ethnic identity. Here, too, was a rare instance in which immigrant women played an unconventional yet significant role in the activities of organized labour and left politics.

Though the point of reference is narrow, the range of topics covered here is not. The nature of Toronto's prewar Jewish community, the position of Jewish workers in the city's garment trades, the widespread anti-Semitism all Jews in the city faced, the structure and working conditions of the city's needleworks sweatshops, and the organization of garment workers, are all part of this account. The nature of Jewish labour activism — which Frager describes as having a double dimension, with many Jewish workers feeling doubly oppressed and exploited by anti-Semitism and their class position - relations between Jewish workers and Jewish employers, relations among Jewish and non-Jewish workers, and the ways in which these relationships influenced the nature, intensity, and effectiveness of workingclass solidarity, are also dealt with. Frager has paid due attention to the cultural world of East European Jewish immigrants, and to the ways in which transplanted Old World religious and secular institutions, in facilitating social ties along ethnic and class lines, furnished the basis for a vibrant class culture from which Jewish labour activists drew in their confrontations with capital.

Where Frager breaks important new ground is in her emphasis on gender dynamics within the Jewish labour movement, and on the activities and consciousness of leading activists, both male and female. It is here that Frager delves most concretely into the interplay among ethnicity, gender and class consciousness. Relying heavily upon oral testimonies, Frager demonstrates that male-dominated Jewish unions and

## 142 left history

Jewish female labour activists themselves failed to recognize the unique problems of women workers, and accordingly failed to devise femaleoriented strategies. More important is Frager's discovery that the nature of Jewish activists' class and ethnic consciousness, which was characterized by a strong socialist orientation, precluded recognition of the special constraints women workers faced. The female activists' own emphasis on the primacy of class and ethnic identity ----on the dual constraints Jewish workers faced, as workers and as Jews living in a capitalist, anti-Semitic society - and their commitment to preserving the traditional patriarchal structure of the Jewish family on behalf of ethnic solidarity and self-preservation, blocked the development of a feminist challenge to women's subordinate place within the Jewish family or within the labour movement itself. Frager thus concludes, somewhat contentiously, that pro-union Jewish women participated in the movement on the basis of an implicit acceptance of their own subordination, adhering to the Jewish socialists' critique of feminism as potentially divisive and therefore harmful to the paramount class and ethnic concerns of Jewish workers and their families. This despite the fact that their very participation in the activities of the Jewish unions and socialist organizations represented a stretching of the traditional gender roles of Jewish women.

This is the one argument of Frager's study which is clearly problematic. It

suggests, for one, that anything short of a clearly articulated support for the principles of feminism is an implicit acceptance of female subordination. More seriously, Frager's emphasis on the female Jewish activists' failure has the perhaps unintended consequence of somewhat diminishing their role within the movement. Frager does little more than suggest that, for women activists in the Jewish labour movement, gender-role elasticity did not lead to feminism.

Difficulties such as these do not obscure the important contributions this book makes. Methodologically, Frager's blending of data from original Yiddish sources with information gathered from English newspapers and those of some of the larger garment workers' unions, proves vital to uncovering the internal dynamics of the Jewish labour movment. Frager does well to offer the reader a look at the dynamics of oral interviews - she comes close to providing a neartranscript of some interviews - while providing adequate critical discussion of the oral data with all its contradictions and shortcomings, recognizing that what is not said in an interview is often as important as what is. The uninitiated will have little difficulty understanding this book's key concepts, while the specialist will find more than enough new grist for the mill.

> Robert Ventresca University of Toronto