

notes – without a hint of irony – that “medical procedures that critics find objectionable are the same ones that male physicians choose for themselves.” (226) This provides a vivid insight into the continuing patriarchal power to be observed in obstetrics (and of the political nature of childbirth both in the past and present) and, at the same time, provides a powerful argument for women and for medical health care workers involved in the care of pregnant and childbearing women to read Murphy-Lawless’ book.

Maxine Rhodes
University of Birmingham

David Goodman, *Fault Lines: Journeys Into The New South Africa* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1999).

David Goodman’s *Fault Lines*, part travelogue, part journalistic expose, and part peoples’ history, is eerily prescient of a potential South African Thermidor.¹ Contrasting the experiences of four pairs of South Africans struggling with the reconfiguration of race, class and gender in the post-apartheid era, Goodman reveals the limitations of the recent South African political revolution to engender an economic revolution. Although Goodman does not employ classical Marxist theory in his analysis, he nevertheless suggests important indicators of a revolution betrayed. It is significant that his point of departure for the book is his assessment of the “Zimbabwean revolution that wasn’t” (9). He captures an often startling grassroots view of people’s frustrations with the transition to a democratic state which questions the fundamental objectives and meaning of the change. Thoughtful, detailed and intense, the book comes at time in which politicians, academics and analysts are only beginning to assess the new democratic and non-racial African National Congress (ANC) Party government.

Goodman, a journalist with established credentials as an anti-apartheid activist, has an intimate knowledge of the southern African political economy. He has honed his understanding of the region through discussions with a wide range of serious scholars and activists and through his own academic research. More importantly, he has done excellent and remarkable interviews with each of his subjects, and this is the book’s main strength. The book is clearly laid out in sections which contrast people divided by race and class. Their stories illuminate major themes in contemporary South Africa including the nature of the new government, the processes of reform and reconciliation, and economic reform.

The few shortcomings and gaps in the book — no mention of South Africa’s significant Indian population, little analysis of the increasingly divergent political parties or rising crime, and almost no discussion of

reinvented African historical legacies — are more than compensated by the lively textured stories presented. Goodman, however, occasionally lapses into distorted characterizations of a stereotypical “true Africa” where “Africa time” (232, 237) prevails, implying that there must have existed a utopian pre-capitalist “Africa” which only lingers on in the uncorrupted fringes of the new state. Nevertheless, Goodman has a clear and deep sympathy for the people he writes about, to the extent that he almost internalizes their ambiguous plight, and remains unwilling, or unable to pass judgment on them.

The subjects of *Fault Lines* are a fascinating mix of new African statesmen and old white fascists; ruthless women entrepreneurs and struggling single-mother workers; intransigent commercial farmers and aspiring peasants. In sum, the haves and have-nots of the country. The first half of the book is devoted to some of the big players in South African history and politics including the ANC stalwart Frank Chikane and the infamous “architect of apartheid,” H.F. Verwoerd, now deceased, and his family. This material, while presented in an interesting and lively way, is very familiar and is in many ways more about the old South Africa than the new. Still, it tries to come to terms with the very unwieldy and ambiguous processes of transition and reconciliation. It is the second half of the book, however, which really comes alive with an analysis of representative examples of common people and their simultaneous struggles against the legacy of apartheid and shortcomings of the new state — clear cases of post-revolutionary angst.

The first pair of figures contrasted are Rev. Frank Chikane, anti-apartheid activist leader, theologian and now member of the ANC government; and Paul Erasmus, state security policeman and erstwhile vicious counterrevolutionary thug. Chikane’s story is archetypical of the struggle. A mission- and Harvard-educated and aspirant middle class African, Chikane made grand sacrifices, and endured brutal torture in the cause of opposition to the racist white regime. He successfully blended aspects of liberation theology with popular appeal to become a leader of the major umbrella opposition United Democratic Front, and more recently to win recognition from the ANC as Director General for the President.

As Goodman suggests, Chikane is more complex and ambiguous than he first appears. There are clearly tensions between Chikane’s Christian ideals and his membership in the ANC — an organization with some members who still espouse a commitment to an alliance with trade unions and the South African Communist Party. While Goodman notes the dramatically improved material circumstances for the Chikane family, he is at pains to emphasize Chikane’s liberal politics. The irony of Chikane building a large new home “not in the leafy enclaves of the formerly all-white [suburbs] but in the gritty womb of Soweto (an oppressed black township) [with] ... ornately scrolled twelve-foot high security gates” (56) seems lost on Goodman.

A more telling aspect of Chikane’s story which the author only alludes to,

until the conclusion, is the politician's role in a new government which now seems bent on entrenching capitalist inequities. Chikane is not the most blatant example of this tendency. As Goodman rightly points out, the Minister of Trade and Industry, Alec Erwin, has been justly accused of going from "communism to casino capitalism" (353). Chikane, nevertheless represents a potentially insidious development: the revolutionary made good in the mold of a capitalist bureaucrat. Although, as Chikane points out, the ANC government faces considerable challenges in overcoming the pernicious effects of apartheid, and it is doing a commendable job on some fronts, it appears wedded to a program of self-imposed structural adjustment which does more for big capital than for the people. Chikane's story is, therefore, as important for understanding the ambiguities of the new vanguard caught between their bourgeois aspirations and a receding commitment to the promises of the revolution as it is for remembering the atrocities of the previous, racist regime. Goodman does address this, but almost as an afterthought.

In dramatic contrast to Chikane, Goodman has delved into the belly of the beast in his remarkable expose of Paul Erasmus. There is little to be sympathetic about with Erasmus, although Goodman tries. Erasmus represents the quintessential South African security police brute. What is most fascinating about Goodman's treatment is how well he captures Erasmus's psychological indoctrination by the police. This is a familiar story, but worth emphasizing. It is precisely the ability of this average person to be transformed into a racist monster which is both chilling and important for understanding how the regime functioned. Moreover, the bizarre intersection of Erasmus and Chikane's lives — Erasmus interrogated and tortured him — brings a unique focus to the complexities of the old South Africa. Ultimately, however, as with H.F. Verwoerd and his son in the following chapter, Erasmus appears unchanged by the process of "healing" facilitated by the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC), which provided amnesty for the "politically motivated" crimes of apartheid in exchange for full disclosure of atrocities committed. While his actions must be remembered, Erasmus, as with others of his ilk, will hopefully be relegated to the dustbin of history.

The most impressive chapters in the book deal with some lesser-known but equally important figures. The differences between Adelaide Buso, squatter, domestic worker and City Councillor in the Cape region and Tumi Modise, rapacious entrepreneur and owner of a cleaning service company, are almost as glaring as between Chikane and Erasmus. Buso represents a vast legion of female domestic workers who have struggled with the pernicious effects of the persistent migrant labour system, limited skills, poor education, racism and patriarchy. Buso's story provides a view of peoples' day-to-day frustrations with the shortcomings of the ANC. Her commentary on the failure of the new government to deliver on promises of housing and opportunity harken back to the early days of the ANC when black middle class values

overshadowed working class solidarity. Goodman does an excellent job of bringing out Orwellian overtones with reference to the government's moniker for the rapidly spreading squalor of shack settlements as "People's housing" (229). In a prophetic riposte to ANC claims of unity in its tenuous alliance with labour, Goodman notes Buso's projection of opposition to the government from the radical left. What emerges from Goodman's analysis of Buso which portends a Thermidorian reaction is her — and millions like her — increasing frustration with the new bureaucracy and, significantly, her desire to break free of urban wage labour by returning to her rural home.

In startling contrast to Buso's humble struggles, Tumi Modise is presented as an unapologetic free marketeer who would be at home in Thatcher's England. She is a street savvy African woman who clawed, and in some cases bludgeoned, her way into the ranks of the "buppie" (black yuppies) through shrewd survival tactics. As an employer of cleaning service workers, Modise's unabashed manipulation of race and affirmative action policies is not as surprising — given current politics — as her belligerent brow-beating of union officials, and Goodman is right to explore both these facets of her character. This chapter brings alive the gritty realities of the economy and labour relations. More importantly, it demonstrates the extent to which capitalism is entrenched in South Africa, despite ANC lip-service to the contrary. Modise is a frightening example of how only a handful of Africans have reinforced a bourgeois ethos by justifying their rise to middle-class status, while millions of others are left behind.

In the final chapters of the book, Goodman considers the critical rural dimension. Here, he examines the lives of two *platteland* Afrikaner farmers, the Niemand's and a struggling African peasant farmer, Matthew Mpshe whose lives intersected through the tragedy of state-run forced removals. Goodman reveals it was Lieb Niemand and his fellow white commercial farmers who helped facilitate the removal and destruction of Mpshe's community, Mogopa, in the mid-1980s by acquiring African cattle at below market price and renting their trucks for transportation at exorbitant rates. Paradoxically, in the new South Africa, the resettled aspiring farmers of Mogopa now rely upon Niemand for the purchase or rental of seed and machinery.

By reinforcing the point that, especially in the countryside, little has changed in black-white labour relations, Goodman has highlighted an emotive issue central to Africans' sense of justice: the land. The fact that the ANC government has made few inroads into land reparations, and that whites still dominate commercial agriculture means that for the few who have returned to their land, the odds are against them. Despite receiving state aid, African farmers, who once challenged white counterparts in productivity, remain frustrated with the change. Goodman cites one Mogopa farmer, who likened the new exceedingly slow bureaucracy to the old (336) as evidence of the general lack of confidence Africans have in their new government. He further

notes that, despite their socialist ideals, the ANC is less interventionist and supportive than its predecessors. Overall, Goodman's tone is perhaps too jubilant for the realities of rural South Africa. As those whom Goodman interviews suggest, it will have to remain for history to unfold for the people of Mogopa and thousands like them to overcome the legacy of apartheid and the limits of change.

In the final analysis, *Fault Lines* is a welcome and accessible addition to non-academic literature on the "new South Africa" which provides some often fresh insights into the contours of the changing South African political economy. For experts and the uninitiated alike, the book is a fascinating foray into another stalled revolution that was not.

Aran MacKinnon
State University of West Georgia

¹ I refer here to Leon Trotsky's theory of Thermidor in the Soviet Union first published as "The Danger of Thermidor" in *La Verite*, 26 Jan. 1933, but also see his *The Revolution Betrayed* (New York 1937).

Michael Goodich, ed., *Other Middle Ages: Witnesses at the Margins of Medieval Society*. The Middle Ages Series. (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press 1998).

While exciting and innovative work proceeds in medieval institutional, economic, and intellectual history, other issues grab the headlines with the arrival of the millennium: gender history, cultural history, the history of marginalized groups, representation, and alterity.¹ Michael Goodich, the author of studies on medieval homosexuality (1979), sainthood (1982), conceptions of the life cycle (1989), and rescue miracles (1995), has produced a collection of translated primary sources for this "new medievalism." Most medieval sourcebooks, Goodich observes, have been devoted principally to the legal records, philosophical tracts, and chronicles that provide evidence for the activity of the male, clerical, political, and intellectual elites of medieval Europe; he seeks to give a voice to those excluded from these worlds, and thus from the sourcebooks. This useful new reader contains sections on Jews, apostates and converts, sexual nonconformists, victims of the devil, heretics, and liminal figures.

We are not lacking, as Goodich acknowledges, specialized readers on medieval Jews, heretics, and women, to which we might add popular religion, saints, and female saints.² Translated materials also appear in articles and monographs.³ In fact, at least a third of the sources offered in this new collection are available in some form elsewhere, though Goodich has done his