

notes that, despite their socialist ideals, the ANC is less interventionist and supportive than its predecessors. Overall, Goodman's tone is perhaps too jubilant for the realities of rural South Africa. As those whom Goodman interviews suggest, it will have to remain for history to unfold for the people of Mogopa and thousands like them to overcome the legacy of apartheid and the limits of change.

In the final analysis, *Fault Lines* is a welcome and accessible addition to non-academic literature on the "new South Africa" which provides some often fresh insights into the contours of the changing South African political economy. For experts and the uninitiated alike, the book is a fascinating foray into another stalled revolution that was not.

Aran MacKinnon
State University of West Georgia

¹ I refer here to Leon Trotsky's theory of Thermidor in the Soviet Union first published as "The Danger of Thermidor" in *La Verite*, 26 Jan. 1933, but also see his *The Revolution Betrayed* (New York 1937).

Michael Goodich, ed., *Other Middle Ages: Witnesses at the Margins of Medieval Society*. The Middle Ages Series. (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press 1998).

While exciting and innovative work proceeds in medieval institutional, economic, and intellectual history, other issues grab the headlines with the arrival of the millennium: gender history, cultural history, the history of marginalized groups, representation, and alterity.¹ Michael Goodich, the author of studies on medieval homosexuality (1979), sainthood (1982), conceptions of the life cycle (1989), and rescue miracles (1995), has produced a collection of translated primary sources for this "new medievalism." Most medieval sourcebooks, Goodich observes, have been devoted principally to the legal records, philosophical tracts, and chronicles that provide evidence for the activity of the male, clerical, political, and intellectual elites of medieval Europe; he seeks to give a voice to those excluded from these worlds, and thus from the sourcebooks. This useful new reader contains sections on Jews, apostates and converts, sexual nonconformists, victims of the devil, heretics, and liminal figures.

We are not lacking, as Goodich acknowledges, specialized readers on medieval Jews, heretics, and women, to which we might add popular religion, saints, and female saints.² Translated materials also appear in articles and monographs.³ In fact, at least a third of the sources offered in this new collection are available in some form elsewhere, though Goodich has done his

own, new translations. The value of this collection is to pull together these old texts, add interesting new ones, and suggest juxtapositions. The principally non-medievalist readership of *Left History* will be most interested in the general subject matter of the various excerpts, in order to learn if they might prove useful for teaching or research; I will describe them briefly before making some observations on the project as a whole.

The section on the Jews offers: accounts of voluntary and forced conversion to Christianity; a description of popular violence against Jewish communities in France; an “ethical will” of a Spanish rabbi; and a Kabbalistic tract. The second section (“Apostates and Converts”) adds autobiographical accounts of a Christian convert to Judaism, and Jewish converts to Christianity and Islam. Goodich also provides a substantial excerpt from the *Life of Ramon Llull*, who abandoned the luxuries of a royal court to pursue a project of converting Muslims to Christianity.

“Sexual Nonconformists and the Fires of Lust” contains instructions from a confessor’s manual for how to inquire into a penitent’s sexual behavior; municipal legislation against prostitution, sodomy, rape, and incest; accounts of exorcism; Church legislation on lepers; and advice on how to write sermons for lepers. Goodich translates here substantial portions of the inquisition record concerning Arnaud of Verniolle, familiar to readers of E. LeRoy Ladurie’s *Montaillou*, whose frequent interfemoral intercourse proved almost as interesting to the inquisition as did his impersonation of a priest.

“Victims of the Devil” contains the most interesting new material: a monk’s account of the “devilish delusions” that challenged his beliefs and his ability to sleep; the vivid letters of a woman describing her physical and mental suffering at the hands of demons; the autobiographical account of a hermit turned pope, describing his own demonic visions and struggles; a fascinating account of an attempted suicide; and a description of possession. “Christian Heterodoxy” addresses the complex subject of heresy. Goodich includes a profession of faith extracted from a heretic; Church legislation against heretics; several inquisition records, including a lengthy excerpt from the trial of Beatrice of Planisolles, a heretic, witch, and “sexual nonconformist” (familiar, again, from *Montaillou*); and accounts of the anti-heretical activities of a female saint.

The final section, “Insiders and Outsiders: Liminality and Integration” examines those Goodich sees as the temporarily excluded, persons who for a time “found themselves at the edges of the traditional family and social structure” (221). Thus we find here rules for congregations of penitents; testimony about two individuals who turned their backs on wealthy families to adopt the religious life; the tale of a miraculous recovery of a child drowning victim; and descriptions of the power of relics over disbelievers, and of the relationship between a local saint and his cult. The coherence of this group of readings is found in the process of exclusion, separation, and reintegration

experienced by the various subjects.

Goodich's categories obviously overlap. This improves the richness of the collection; readings could be selected to illustrate, for example, the role of women in medieval societies, or the nature of rural life. On the other hand, this overlap highlights a serious conceptual problem. Goodich lists marginal groups that he could have added to the reader: women, rural folk, inhabitants of geographically remote areas, criminals, the unemployed. This list applies to perhaps 95 percent of the population. When monastic chroniclers, saints, and popes can be called marginal, as well, the usefulness of the category dissolves. People are marginal only in relation to a centre, and people are marginalized only by others. A group of texts describing marginal groups so broadly defined is the sourcebook equivalent of one hand clapping. More of a focus on the process, rather than the fact, of marginalization might have clarified the logic of the collection. For example, Goodich does not grapple with the distinction between groups and individuals. Jews were marginalized as a community; the possessed were excluded one by one. Is this difference relevant to the model of marginalization? Curiously, despite his attempt to give a voice to the silenced, most of the sources Goodich presents were in fact produced by the centre, not by the margins; this is most problematic in the case of inquisition and canonization records, recognized by many as highly deceptive. The autobiographical and unmediated accounts included here are especially valuable, but they represent only one third of the collection. Goodich does acknowledge this problem, but he cannot make it disappear; a better solution might have been to embrace it.

The texts are mostly translated from Latin, with a handful from Hebrew and Arabic. Similarly, they are principally from the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, with a few from the eleventh and twelfth. All regions of Western Europe are represented, with a heavy Italian bias. The thirty-five selections themselves range from one to twenty-four pages in length, though most are edited down to less than five pages. This will frustrate teachers who prefer to use more complete texts. Goodich provides introductions on three levels: to the book, to each section, and to each reading. While taken together they are somewhat rambling and repetitious, this is not a book that is meant to be read cover to cover. Still, the various introductions, along with well-chosen references to a key secondary treatment in English for each excerpt and a brief bibliography at the end, will make this collection very accessible to non-specialist readers and students.

Adam Kosto
Columbia University

¹ Peter Monaghan, "Medievalists, Romantics No Longer, Take Stock of Their Growing Discipline," *The Chronicle of Higher Education*, 30 October 1998, A 15; Paul Freedman

and Gabrielle M. Spiegel, "Medievalisms Old and New: The Rediscovery of Alterity in North American Medieval Studies," *American Historical Review* 103 (1998), 677–704.

² Jacob R. Marcus, ed., *The Jew in the Medieval World: A Source Book* (New York 1938); Walter L. Wakefield and Austin P. Evans, eds., *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* (New York 1969); Katharina M. Wilson, ed., *Medieval Women's Visionary Literature* (New York 1986); John Shinnars, ed., *Medieval Popular Religion: A Reader* (Peterborough, Ont. 1997); Thomas F. X. Noble and Thomas Head, eds., *Soldiers of Christ: Saints and Saints' Lives from Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages* (University Park, Penn. 1995); Jo Ann McNamara and John E. Halborg, eds., *Sainted Women of the Dark Ages* (Durham 1992). Many translated sources are conveniently available through *The Online Medieval Sourcebook* at <http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/sbook.html>.

³ For example, John Boswell's *Christianity, Social Tolerance, and Homosexuality: Gay People in Western Europe from the Beginning of the Christian Era to the Fourteenth Century* (Chicago 1980) contains an appendix of eighteen texts.

Bruce Gilley, *Tiger on the Brink, Jiang Zemin and China's New Elite* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998).

In the immediate aftermath of the 1989 Tiananmen Square Massacre the transition from the second to the third generation of Chinese Communist Party leadership acquired a specific form: an increasingly frail, diminutive Deng Xiaoping brought a bespectacled, rotund Jiang Zemin into the political limelight. Deng Xiaoping supported, protected, and cultivated the political future of Jiang Zemin, ensuring Jiang's methodical rise through the ranks. By 1994, Jiang had assumed the titles of State President, Party General Secretary, Chairman of the Central Military Commission, Core Leader, and Chief Engineer. Bruce Gilley's *Tiger on the Brink* traces Jiang's career and demonstrates that, while not inevitable, Jiang's ascendancy to the centre of the post-1989 Chinese leadership was based on years of active participation in high-level Chinese politics, most notably as mayor of Shanghai. Gilley furnishes a much-needed outline of Jiang's political involvement from the 1940s through 1998 and provides the reader with insight into both elite factional politics in post-Mao China and the personality of China's leader.

An emphasis on the relative positioning of Jiang Zemin vis-à-vis existing and emerging factions within the Chinese leadership leads Gilley to conclude that Jiang's success derived, perhaps counter-intuitively, from a weak personal power base. Jiang perfected the art of consensus politics and currying favour with influential persons; he never enjoyed the unquestioned support of one faction in particular. Gilley's provocative argument stems from thorough research of factional alignments at various historical moments relevant to Jiang's political career. Gilley's overwhelming concern with *who* forged alliances with whom, however, comes at the expense of careful analysis of