

claims, nor should they. Rather they should approach these valuable and provocative writings as allies in a fight to save what is best in music, and in ourselves, from a process which, afraid of the potential of human freedom, seeks to debase and destroy it. The culture industry subsists on acquiescence; the inherent promise of great music is that, through the committed exercise of human freedom, it can be overcome, even if only briefly for each of us. Adorno's is an honorable effort on behalf of that freedom, and the greater world toward which it beckons.

Justin E.A. Busch
McMaster University

Paola A. Sensi-Isolani and Phylis Cancilla Martinelli, eds., *Struggle and Success: An Anthology of the Italian Immigrant Experience in California* (New York: Center for Migration Studies 1993).

In *Struggle and Success: An Anthology of the Italian Immigrant Experience in California*, editors Paola A. Sensi-Isolani and Phylis Cancilla Martinelli have added some breadth to what has been a fairly narrow topic. The study of Italians in California has been the subject of very few monographs, and they have almost exclusively been focused on the urban immigrant experience.¹ *Struggle and Success*' multi-disciplinary construction has expanded the parameters to include rural Italian Americans, but not at the expense of their urban brethren, and therefore allows the reader to compare and contrast these two distinct groups. Furthermore, *Struggle and Success* contains a variety of cultural, economic, and political

1 See George Ponzetta, "Immigrants and Ethnics: The State of Italian-American Historiography," *Journal of American Ethnic History* Vol. 9, 1 (Fall, 1989), 67-95.

essays that suggest several different points around which to compare the urban and rural experience. In their introduction, the editors clearly state the motivation of putting together such an anthology is “to provide for a more comprehensive and balanced view of California’s Italians.”

To achieve this balance, the book is divided into four parts: the “historical perspective;” “occupations and economic life;” “social and political experience;” and “the immigrant community.” Each part contains a general introduction provided by the editors, and these are useful in presenting historiographical context for the essays. The introductions provide a linking theme that may otherwise have been lost among such a diverse collection of interpretations. The balanced mix of seven old and five new essays use a variety of methodologies and sources which give the volume a unique flavor. There are contributions from well-known writers Maxine Seller (on Italian theater) and Stephen Fox (Italian-American internment during World War II), but many of the essays are from young historians, sociologists, and anthropologists. Finally, there is a short conclusion provided by the editors and an interesting nineteen-page photo essay that reflects the theme of the anthology.

This theme is also the strength of the monograph. Over and over, the reader is reminded of the diversity of the California Italian immigrant experience and how this diversity included both success and failure. By focusing so much on the variety of skills brought by the immigrants, the book succeeds in satisfying the requirements of what Rudolph Vecoli has called “radioactive tracer” studies.² It also provides at least two examples of fine scholarship; Maxine Seller’s essay on the Italian theater of San Francisco and Felice Bonadio’s study of the Bank of Italy and its enigmatic founder A.P. Giannini. The essays that deal with the rural experience highlight

2 Rudolph J. Vecoli, “From the ‘Uprooted’ to the ‘Transplanted’: the Writing of American Immigration History, 1951-1989,” in *From ‘Melting Pot’ to Multiculturalism: The Evolution of Ethnic Relations in the United States and Canada*, ed. by Valeria Gennaro Lerda (Rome 1990), 39.

the importance of considering this dimension to any immigrant group, especially when such an overwhelming majority of the scholarship on Italian-Americans has been Eastern and urban in scope. Theme is therefore not without substance supporting it, but there are shortcomings in this collection.

Even though Dino Cinel's seminal study of the Italian immigrants of San Francisco is referred to by most of the essays (and in particular by the editor's introductions), it seems to hover around the periphery.³ It may have been quite useful to have included one of Cinel's writings, whether a separate article or an essay edited from his book as was done with the essay by Fox. Cinel's work has been too influential to be omitted. As well, some of the essays are simply too limited in their approach. For example, the study of the Italian-Swiss Colony Wine Company is interesting but relies too heavily on the founder's own memoirs and contemporaneous magazine and newspaper articles. Instead of adding to our understanding of the immigrant experience, it merely re-tells a small chapter of its history. This is not without merit of course, but would be more appropriate in another collection.

The anthology also seems to neglect at least one component of the Italian immigrant experience which one would assume to have significance; the impact of religion. Religion is a cornerstone to the travails of many immigrant groups. Often, the Church provided a communal, cultural, and linguistic focal point for immigrants especially among Roman Catholic groups. This point is not lost on the editors who address this very point in their introduction to part three "Social and Political Experience." Yet there is no essay which is attuned to the question of religion. Instead, the editors seem to have relied on Cinel's observation that Italian immigrants in San Francisco, particularly young men, rejected the Catholic Church as an influence and were alienated by its Irish-dominated leadership.⁴

3 Dino Cinel, *From Italy to San Francisco: The Immigrant Experience* (Stanford 1982).

4 Cinel, *From Italy to San Francisco*, 209.

Also, Sensi-Isolani's essay on a rural group (which uses 26 oral interviews quite extensively) portrays, in part, the rural Italians as non-Catholic, or at most converted Protestants. Yet aside from writings offered by the editors, the reader is not given an analysis of why this abstention occurred and how that may have been unique among California Italians in relation to other Italian-Americans.

On the whole, however, the mere efforts of this book make it a worthy contribution. Its goals are not only noble in their pursuit, but often in their attainment. *Struggle and Success* reflects some of the new avenues of approach found in modern immigration history, and this is in itself significant. While focused on a very particular group, it contributes positively to a much greater whole.

John Walsh
University of Ottawa

Tina Loo and Lorna R. R. McLean, eds., *Historical Perspectives on Law And Society in Canada* (Toronto: Copp Clark Longman, 1994).

Fifteen years ago, in introducing the Osgoode Society's first volume, David Flaherty prosletized about that which was then called "the new legal history."⁵ He called on Canadian historians to follow the lead of American scholars like Willard Hurst and Robert Gordon and analyze the connections between law and society.⁶ As Flaherty explained it, for too many years Canadian legal academics and social scientists had been working in mutually exclusive vacu-

5 David H. Flaherty, "Writing Canadian Legal History: An Introduction," in Flaherty, ed., *Essays in the History of Canadian Law*, Vol. 1 (Toronto 1981), 3-42.

6 Flaherty cited Hurst's seminal work *The Growth of American Law: The Law Makers* (Boston 1950) and Gordon "J. Willard Hurst and the Common Law Tradition in American Legal Historiography," *Law and Society Review* X (1975), 44-55.